

7 DCSE2003/2380/F - RECONSTRUCTION OF EXISTING OUTBUILDING TO GARAGE AND STORE, KILN GREEN BARN, KILN GREEN, WALFORD, ROSS-ON-WYE, HEREFORDSHIRE, HR9 5RE**For: C. A. Burley, Kiln Green Barn, Kiln Green, Walford, Ross-on-Wye, Herefordshire, HR9 5RE****Date Received: 5th August, 2003 Ward: Kerne Bridge Grid Ref: 6015 1985****Expiry Date: 30th September, 2003**

Local Member: Councillor Mrs. R. F. Lincoln

1. Site Description and Proposal

- 1.1 The application property occupies an elevated site at Kiln Green. Although the property adjoins the highway, access is off a narrow track. Planning permission for conversion of the barn to a dwellinghouse was granted in 1994. The barn is roughly centrally placed on this sizeable plot and is about 40 m from the highway.
- 1.2 About 10 m from the north-east corner of the barn a garage and store has been constructed. Permission was granted for the conversion of an existing outbuilding to a garage/store in 1998. The outbuilding was only partly of stone construction and the permitted scheme involved raising the height of the walls and constructing a ridge roof. According to the applicant the scheme did not prove to be practicable and a new building was constructed. The latter is larger than the permitted conversion scheme : about 200mm longer, 300mm wider and 100mm higher at ridge and with a less steep roof pitch. The dimensions are 8.8m x 5.65m x 4.6m to ridge.
- 1.3 Planning permission had previously been refused twice for conversion to a granny annexe. The reasons in the later case (SE1999/3193/F) were as follows:
1. The proposal would involve extensive refurbishment/rebuilding of this out-building to form a detached annexe. The proposal would conflict therefore with Policy H20 of the Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan and Policy SH11 of the South Herefordshire District Local Plan, which seek to protect the character of the open countryside by restricting residential development and with Policy T1A of the Local Plan as the proposal would not help to reduce the need to travel and would not therefore be environmentally sustainable.
 2. The annexe would be detached from the main dwellinghouse and it may be difficult to resist pressure for use as a separate residential unit once there is no further need for annexe accommodation.

2. Policies**2.1 Planning Policy Guidance**

PPG.7 - The Countryside: Environmental Quality and Economic and Social Development

2.2 Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan

- Policy CTC.2 - Area of Great Landscape Value
 Policy H.20 - Housing in Rural Areas

2.3 South Herefordshire District Local Plan

- Policy C.5 - Development within Area of Great Landscape Value
 Policy C.37 - Development within Area of Great Landscape Value
 Policy SH.23 - Extensions to Dwellings
 Policy GD.1 - General Development Criteria
 Supplementary Planning Guidance : Re-use and Adaptation of Traditional Rural Buildings

2.4 Unitary Development Plan

- Policy HBA12 - Re-use of Traditional Rural Buildings
 Policy HBA13 - Re-use of Traditional Rural Buildings for Residential Purposes
 Policy H18 - Alterations and Extensions

3. Planning History

- 3.1 SH940424PF Conversion of barn to dwelling - Permitted 26.8.94
 SH971185PF Annexe for dependent relative - Refused 17.12.97
 SS980835PF Conversion of existing outbuilding to a garage and store - Permitted 10.12.09
 SE1999/3193/F Refurbishment/part rebuilding of outbuilding to provide one bedroom family annexe - Refused 17.4.2000

4. Consultation Summary

- 4.1 No statutory or non-statutory consultations required.

Responses by internal consultees that raise material planning issues are summarised and considered in the Officers Appraisal.

5. Representations

- 5.1 The applicant makes the following submission:

- it is understood that the alterations to openings and very slight increase in footprint are of no concern to Planning Department
- inner blockwork was set out on assumption that would be 4" of stonework but in fact stonework is about 8" and estimate has been enlarged by about 200mm in each direction
- Planning Officer recommended that slightly less than half be re-built with new footings but remaining half was out of true, in very poor condition and a large area collapsed when refurbishment commenced - good building practice therefore required rebuilding
- building is not obtrusive and in keeping with the barn and attractive stone and slate work.

5.2 Parish Council comment as follows:

The greatly increased roof height shown in these plans together with the roof light cause concern. Following refusal of consent to the previous application to provide a family annexe, SE1999/3193/F, the Parish Council ask for the use to be limited to garage and store.

5.3 Two letters of objection have been received. In summary, the following points are made:

- planning permission to build a granny annexe on site of outbuilding refused twice followed by application to convert to garage/store
- photographs submitted to show size of new building; clearly twice height of original and probably 4 times in volume and bears all the hallmarks of a future 'granny annexe'
- visible from skyline third of a mile away and from one objector's house quarter of a mile away - visually intrusive, fits uncomfortably with surrounding buildings and height out of keeping with surrounding landscape
- no dimensions on drawings of old or new buildings, no mention of ground works nor that application retrospective
- conditions imposed regarding landscaping and splay on original permission not complied with and ugly flue fitted to house - disregard of planning control suggests that there will be attempt to convert new building to a dwelling. This would aggravate surface water problems and lead to unacceptable levels of traffic on the track (a bridleway)
- building is configured as a dwelling for which no proven need, there is negligible public transport and in an Area of Great Landscape Value
- if planning permission granted would set worrying precedent that can build without planning permission
- condition should be imposed that could never be used as a dwelling.

The full text of these letters can be inspected at Southern Planning Services, Blueschool House, Blueschool Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

6. Officers Appraisal

6.1 The Council's guidelines encourage existing buildings to be used for garaging when rural buildings are converted to residential use. In this case this was not practicable within the main barn. The existing outbuilding was not suitable as it was and required significant works to enable it to be used as a garage and store. Nevertheless this was within the spirit of the Council's (at that stage informal) guidelines for barn conversions. The resultant building would have been somewhat longer than a typical double garage (about 8.6m compared to 6m) but less wide and of similar height.

6.2 The building was in poor condition and it can be appreciated why extension and conversion proved impracticable. New garaging for barn conversions is not encouraged in the Supplementary Planning Guidance (the original scheme is considered to be "finite") nevertheless this has generally been accepted provided it is in keeping with the existing buildings and not intrusive in the landscape. In this case the new garage/store is built of the same distinctive and attractive local stone as the barn and with a matching slate roof. Although longer than a typical square garage, it is a more pleasing shape. As noted earlier it is not unduly tall. As the land rises away from the barn the garage/store has a significantly higher ground level but nevertheless

it is not considered to be out of scale with the barn. Being on an elevated plot the building is visible over a wider area but in the context of the barn and with a tall hedge along the northern boundary would not be intrusive in the landscape. The garage is clearly visible from along the track and further hedge planting would help to integrate the garage into its setting.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be granted subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Within two months of the date of this permission a scheme of landscaping shall be submitted for approval in writing by the local planning authority. The approved scheme shall be implemented before the garage/store is brought into use.**

Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the area.

- 2. G05 (Implementation of landscaping scheme (general))**

Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the area.

- 3. Details of the doors and windows shall be submitted for approval in writing before they are installed. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.**

Reason: To ensure that the development is satisfactory in appearance.

- 4. E09 (No conversion of garage to habitable accommodation)**

Reason: To define the terms of the permission and to ensure adequate off-street parking arrangements remain available at all times.

Decision:

Notes:

.....

Background Papers

Internal departmental consultation replies.